RVC OPEN ACCESS REPOSITORY - COPYRIGHT NOTICE

This is the accepted manuscript of Elizabeth Armitage-Chan and Stephen A May, The Veterinary Identity: A Time and Context Model.

The final version is available online in the *Journal of Veterinary Medical Education* via University of Toronto Press: https://doi.org/10.3138/jvme.0517-067r1



The Veterinary Identity: A Time and Context Model.

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

1

Abstract: The nature of professionalism teaching is a current issue in veterinary education, with an individual's identity as a professional having implications for their values and behaviours, and for their career satisfaction and psychological wellbeing. An appropriately formed professional identity imparts competence in making complex decisions: those that involve multiple perspectives and are complicated by contextual challenges. It enables an individual to act in a way that aligns with their professional values and priorities, and imparts resilience to situations in which their actions are dissonant to these personal beliefs. There are challenges in professionalism teaching that relate to student engagement and faculty confidence in this area. However, these cannot be addressed without first defining the veterinary professional identity, in effect, the aim of professionalism teaching. In this paper, existing identity models from the wider literature have been analysed through a veterinary lens. This analysis has then been used to construct a model of veterinary professional identity which incorporates the self (personal morals and values), social development (learning from the workplace environment), and professional behaviours. Individuals that form what we have termed "self-environment-behaviour connections" are proposed to be able to use workplace learning opportunities to inform their identity development, such that environmental complexity does not obstruct the link between values and behaviours. Those who fail to connect with the environment in this way may perceive that environmental influences (the client, financial limitations) are obstructive to enacting their desired identity, and they may struggle with decisionmaking in complex scenarios.

2122

Keywords: Professionalism, identity, wellbeing, resilience.

24

Introduction

> The teaching of professionalism, and the development of professional identity, are current issues in both medical and veterinary education. 1,2 Placing the concept of professional identity into education makes explicit the responsibility of medical and veterinary educators to support the development of an appropriate identity in their students. In medicine this process of formation has been described as the way in which the values, attitudes and behaviours of the profession are internalised in the progression from student to doctor. In 2012, Mossop broached the question, in this journal, "Is it time to define veterinary professionalism?", and reviewed the literature relating to professionalism in medicine. Since her article, some of the leading authors she cited have advocated a move away from "teaching professionalism" to medical students, towards curriculum support for the process of identity formation.² This change in focus incorporates the significance of context and environmental complexity to the individual professional's decisions and actions, prompts the individual to consider not only the way they act, but also their underlying values and motivations, and places a greater emphasis on the diversity of priorities and values that exist within a profession's members.³ Challenges for veterinary education include determining how teaching designed around professional identity formation will be of benefit to current and future veterinarians. Alongside this, we need to identify our teaching aims: a model of professional identity and its formation that is of most value to our profession.

Professional identity can be defined as the set of values and priorities that are meaningful to the individual, and which guide and inform their behaviours in their professional role. Although some authors² emphasise the common values and attributes (such as altruism and integrity) that are held by members of a profession, others highlight the differences in identity priorities between members of a profession.⁴ In Castellani and Hafferty's model, they demonstrate that a successful medical profession incorporates members who differently value and prioritise attributes such as patient altruism, work-life balance, commercialism and social justice (equality in healthcare access).⁴ In this framework, an individual will personally determine their own prioritisation of these professional attributes, and their professional identity will depend in part on their pre-held personal and cultural identity values. Their professional identity formation will then represent the process of these values being moulded, adapted and negotiated as the individual enters into the professional environment. The individual may remain strongly adhered to their original set of personal identity values, and how they conceived these as being demonstrated in their professional self. Such individuals must find a way, during professional identity development, to negotiate these into their professional

behaviours. Alternatively, and at the other extreme, an individual may eschew their previous beliefs, and build a new set of identity values based on those demonstrated by their professional peers. Others will fall somewhere in between, and use their entry to the professional environment (initially during workplace learning and later as a novice professional) to adapt and develop their previous beliefs, creating a new set of "context-informed" identity values, that represent an adapted version of their pre-professional selves.

The wider literature contains a huge volume of work devoted to defining identity, situated in both social and personal frameworks.⁵⁻⁷ Models of medical professional identity development are available.² However, in contrast to professionalism, where many of the individual attitudes and behaviours are shared between doctors and veterinarians, the significant differences in focus and structure between the veterinary and medical professions necessitate our own model of professional identity and its development. The majority of veterinary graduates enter general practice immediately after graduation, without entering formal programmes of mentoring or postgraduate education.⁸ They must become competent at working independently, with responsibility for their own patients, in the early weeks of work. The change from "identity as student", with little to no responsibility for decision-making, to "identity as professional", with full responsibility for patient care, therefore occurs rapidly, and without a period of sustained, gradual withdrawal of supervision. New veterinary graduates make decisions that have implications for the veterinary business, the emotional state of their clients (and of the clients' families), and the working life of their colleagues, as well as the health and welfare of their patients. They must use discretion in their actions, judging whether to provide textbook versions of "gold-standard" approaches to disease diagnosis and treatment, create adapted versions to fit the individual situation, or simply provide reassurance that no clinical intervention is needed.⁹

With this in mind, we propose that a model of veterinary professional identity will incorporate environment and context – the veterinary graduate's actions are highly context-dependent and we consider that an identity that ignores context is not appropriate. The acquisition of this identity will be a developmental process, as the student transfers from the "textbook" veterinarian of student-hood, to the autonomous veterinary professional of the work environment. In this paper we will first discuss why the notion of professional identity is an important issue for the novice professional. Existing identity frameworks will then be reviewed to help construct a veterinary-specific identity model.

The importance of professional identity to the early career professional

96

97

98 99

100

101

102

103104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

114

94

95

We have previously identified that the way early career veterinarians define their identity influences the sense of wellbeing they experience in their work. 10 Individuals who define their professional priorities on the basis of working alongside the client, colleagues and the business, and are not simply focused on prioritizing patient diagnosis and treatment, seem better placed to draw satisfaction from their role. This is perhaps unsurprising, as particularly in general veterinary practice, there will be relatively few scenarios in which a definitive diagnosis can be made, and for which evidence-supported recommendations for treatment can be implemented. 9 Patients may get better before a diagnosis is reached, client finances may reduce the opportunities for diagnostic tests and treatment options, and limited clinic equipment or expertise may preclude the desired clinical management. 10 If an individual constructs their identity as one who values these contextual challenges, and thrives on the opportunity to create individual solutions to problems presented in the professional environment, they will be more likely to encounter situations that allow them to fulfil their identity priorities. In our research, for those individuals who persistently and exclusively prioritized only a successful diagnosis and treatment, contextual complexity (equipment availability, client wishes, financial limitations) was not seen as a valued component of their role. Instead of representing a challenge to overcome or problem to work through, these contextual elements appeared only as frustrating obstructions to the realization of identity goals. The actions that were prioritized by these individuals, and which represented their desired self-identity, were seen to be blocked by challenges within the veterinary environment.

115116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126127

The association between identity conceptualisation and mental wellbeing is well known, with a well-documented link between identity and psychological wellbeing. ^{11,12} Identity dissonance (acting in a way that is discordant with the prioritised values and goals of the individual) was described by Taylor as evoking feelings of anxiety, instability, and a perceived lack of control over one's environment. ¹³ In contrast, behaving in a way that consistently aligns with one's own beliefs, goals and values is a key foundation of psychological wellbeing. ¹⁴ Alignment of one's identity values and external behaviours is facilitated if the individual moves into a social context in which the norms of the group mirror the goals of the individual (self-verification theory). ¹⁵ Alternatively, the individual can achieve this if they are able to negotiate their own values into their environment and retain the ability to act "true to self" in a variety of social contexts (self-determination theory). ¹⁶ For veterinarians who define their identity according to a limited, narrow set of professional priorities, there will be a limit

to the professional environments in which they will experience the wellbeing associated with aligning actions and identity goals. They will require the client population, clinic equipment and expertise, and employment culture all to be enabling to them achieving their professional priorities. They may therefore find themselves restricted to specific practice types, such as referral work, shelter medicine or charity practice. They may also perpetually change practices, to find a work environment in which contextual features are not perceived as obstructive to their prioritised behaviours. For those individuals who define their professional identity more broadly, and for whom contextual features represent part of their identity values (e.g. the ability to work alongside stakeholders to find the best clinical action for the needs of the patient, business and client), they will be more able to act in a way that is aligned with their identity, and will be able to do so in a range of different professional environments. Ryan and Deci's self-determination theory predicts that wellbeing will be supported if an individual can seek out and complete challenges and tasks that are important to them and that are aligned with their own values, and in doing so work with others who share similar values. This suggests that for veterinarians who define their identity more broadly, wellbeing will derive from the satisfaction achieved from problem-solving environmental challenges and being able to create individual solutions in partnership with clients and colleagues. 16

144145

146

147

148

149

150

151152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

An identity built around dualistic notions of the "single right" way to diagnose and treat patients may be seen as a naïve view of the professional role. A difference between this narrow view, emphasising patient treatment, and the broader view, incorporating challenges of the professional environment, has also been described by young doctors as they enter the professional environment.¹⁷ However, a discrepancy between perceptions of the prized veterinary identity (what the individual feels they ought to be), and the actual identity (what they are) is not restricted to the early veterinary career, and contributes to career stress. ¹⁸ The veterinary clinic is a complex environment, in which the needs of wider stakeholders frequently conflict with professional goals aimed at resolution of disease. 19 Whether this environmental complexity is embraced, and internalized into the veterinary identity, or is seen as a persistent barrier to it, will contribute to whether an individual perceives a sense of achievement and satisfaction with their career. Improved understanding of professional identity and the determinants of its development are therefore important to the discourse surrounding veterinary career satisfaction and psychological wellbeing. A conceptual framework of the veterinary identity that is appropriate to success in veterinary practice may offer benefits in preventing dissonance between the idealized and actualized professional identity, if students are supported in the development of such an identity. Helping students in this way offers the potential to enhance their resilience to the stresses of the veterinary professional

environment. Curricular interventions that scaffold this professional identity formation are described elsewhere.³

Review of identity frameworks

We will now review existing frameworks for defining identity and describing its formation. These will then be integrated in the construction of a veterinary-specific model.

1. Marcia's Identity Statuses.

Marcia's identity status model helps us to understand several important concepts in the formation of an identity, and how the way that an identity is developed influences emotional well-being and satisfaction with one's actions. Within the wider identity literature, conceptions of professional identity formation integrate personal and social identity frameworks. 5,6,13,20 Personal morality and values ("the self", or personal identity) underpin a socially constructed and validated set of actions and behaviours that are expressed by the individual in their professional context. Social influences can be enabling to the exteriorisation of inner values in visible actions and behaviours: ²¹ joining a like-minded group, whose members share common values, leads to an empowering sense of "fitting in", increasing self-esteem and encouraging expression of behaviours supported by the group.²² Social construction of learning is supported, facilitating members' self-actualization.²³ Alternatively, it may be inhibitory, suppressing the demonstration of an individual's identity values if this would lead to conflict. An emphasis on sense of identity (self-awareness of one's values and moral position) is also important: this awareness imparts a moral compass, such that when faced with a dilemma, the individual senses whether a chosen action is aligned with their values, or is dissonant to them. ¹³ Self-identity awareness and the different ways an individual can develop their identity as a result of their social interactions are central to Marcia's identity conceptualisation.²⁴

In this model, the "achieved" identity status is considered to represent the most well-developed form of identity construction. Such an individual possesses a strong self-awareness of their own priorities and values, and has informed this identity through a process of engaging with different options. This process, known as identity exploration, allows the individual to make decisions about their identity that are informed by identifying alternatives in their social environment. Through this process, the individual also gains insight to their own self-identity values, by reflecting on self,

making comparisons with "other" (individuals possessing alternate identity values and priorities), and adapting as a result of this experience. The achieved identity status represents an identity selection that is informed by an appreciation and valuing of other. As a result, individuals possessing alternative views and priorities can be encountered reflectively and non-defensively. For the veterinarian, clients or colleagues possessing differing priorities can therefore be understood nonjudgmentally, allowing a reasoned decision to be made in the face of conflicting needs. This welldeveloped sense of identity also imparts an ability to self-analyse, and understand one's own behaviours in the context of self-values and moral beliefs, and those of others within a particular situation. This ability to rationalise one's own actions contributes to the documented lower anxiety levels demonstrated in such individuals. ²⁵ Behaviours are understood as either aligning with self, or in some circumstances, through necessity, aligning with other. Discordant behaviours are therefore understood not as a representation of self, but as a transient necessary action, for example to empathise with a client or colleague possessing different identity values. A further benefit to the achieved identity status arises from the well-developed understanding of self. A strong sense of one's own values and priorities provides guidance and confidence in decision-making and taking actions, particularly in the face of uncertainty. For the novice veterinarian, this imparts a higher level of competence in reasoning and decision-making in relation to the complex scenarios of the veterinary professional.¹⁹

Marcia's diffused and foreclosed identity statuses represent naïve and under-developed identies. ²⁵ The "foreclosed" identity status is one that has arisen in the absence of social exploration, and the individual remains resistant to being informed by alternative identities. Such individuals have a strong sense of self; for the novice veterinarian they will have a good understanding of their own professional priorities so are typically able to decide what course of action they wish to take in a clinical situation. However they have an under-developed appreciation of *other*, and struggle to value different ways of doing. They can therefore become defensive or judgmental when they are challenged by those with alternative priorities or approaches to practice. They are also at risk from a lack of sense of belonging if their views and actions are different from those of their peers, and they may feel isolated and unable to "fit in". The "diffused" identity status also results from a lack of identity exploration, but contrasts with "foreclosed" individuals because they lack a sense of their own identity. Without an understanding of their own priorities, they struggle to identify a desired action and, when faced with a complex dilemma, they must seek the opinions of a peer or authority figure. For graduating veterinarians, such individuals may therefore show an increased dependence on close mentoring and the availability of authority figures to support their decisions. If left alone,

they may struggle to take actions with their cases, and delay challenging decisions until assistance from senior colleagues becomes available. In further contrast to those with a foreclosed identity status, the lack of strong self-identity values means such individuals tend to be very happy and at ease with their actions, very easily move into a group, and "fit in" with peers. They therefore tend to demonstrate emotional well-being, as long as they are not challenged regarding their actions, and are not left unsupported to resolve complex veterinary scenarios (such as a client with limited finances asking for an amended treatment plan).

The last of Marcia's identity statuses is described as an individual being in a state of "moratorium". They are actively undergoing identity exploration, and have a deep understanding of differences in identity priorities and values. Whereas those with a "foreclosed" or "diffused" identity status may represent Perry's dualistic approach to knowledge²⁶ (there is a "right" approach, determined either by the individual's values, or those of their group), those in a moratorium state possess a multiplicity understanding of identity. They are acutely aware of many alternatives, have an appreciation of complexity, and are willing to see a dilemma from multiple different perspectives. However, they lack a strong sense of self, and therefore struggle to make the commitment to an identity (and to a decision in a complex situation). This identity status is of concern within the veterinary profession, because their deeply reflective understanding of complexity and alternative viewpoints manifests in high levels of anxiety, resulting from an inability to commit to a valued sense of self.^{23,24} Such veterinarians may demonstrate perpetual anxiety surrounding their actions, perceiving them to be inferior to those of an assumed *other*, an apparently superior identity.

Marcia's model therefore helps to demonstrate the importance of an informed and clear self-identity, which results from engaging with the different sets of identity priorities and values present in the work environment. This process of engaging with identity in the social context will now be explored further through the work of Billett²⁷ and Korthagen²⁸.

2. The importance of context to identity development: The work of Billett and Korthagen.

Like Marcia, Billett conceptualises identity formation through social engagement, and more specifically, the construction of professional identity through engaging in professional work.²⁷ The process described is complex, and it is not surprising that as the veterinary student experiences workplace learning opportunities, they may simply learn the technical competences of professional work.²⁹ Billett identified that entering the work environment can result in a re-shaping of the sense

of self. However he emphasises that this requires active engagement and individual agency in the utilisation of this experience to inform the developing identity. The individual must have "intentions, gaze and engagement". This identification and exploration of identities in the workplace, and engagement in reshaping self, requires interaction with the social elements of the workplace: professional and local norms, and the complex interactions of professionals, paraprofessionals and clients with different identity values. The actions, observations and methods of engaging in this process are undefined, but we have conceived this individual intention to observe and reflect on different identities, and to consider the differences between self and other, as the formation of a self-environment connection. By "connecting" their self-values with the work environment, individuals can begin to reflect on how to negotiate their self-priorities into the profession. The developing identity becomes informed by the different identity values demonstrated by professionals, as well as by the client and wider team.

In the previous section, we have described the significance of alignment of self and behaviours, and shown that for the wellbeing of the developing professional, it is important for behaviours to reflect self, within the work environment. Building on the idea of a self-environment connection, Korthagen's "Onion" model of identity helps conceptualise the formation of connections between self and behaviours. In this model, an individual's "inner core" (their values) is expressed in their "outer layer" as actions and behaviours, the whole individual then sitting in the external environment. Korthagen described identity as something that "anchors the self to social systems" i.e. it connects core values to externally observable actions in the social context. Identity formation is proposed to involve the formation of this connection between inner values and observable actions, allowing the individual to act in a way that remains true to self. The connection is 2-way, and therefore when formed, allows an individual's activities (workplace learning behaviours) to inform their core values. In our context, engaging with the workplace environment to form a self-environment-behaviours connection includes learning to learn from the diverse "content" present in the veterinary clinic. This includes identifying the environmental features that challenge the connection of behaviours to self.

The strengths of this model are that as identity is formed in context, the process incorporates a way of connecting self-values to behaviours. Korthagen conceptualised the informing of self from the environment as occurring through learning behaviours. It could be argued that this neglects the cognitive and affective elements of self-environment engagement, which are portrayed in Billett's "intentions and gaze" and also in Bourdieu's "habitus". In one of Bourdieu's earliest descriptions of

"habitus", he writes: "[by] integrating past experiences, [habitus] functions at every moment as a matrix of perceptions, appreciations, and actions and makes possible the achievement of infinitely diversified tasks..." (Bourdieu 1998, quoted in Lizardo 2004, 32 emphases added). An exclusive emphasis on behavioural learning, without affective, reflective and analytical components, also presents a risk that inappropriate environmental behaviours (such as mimicking inappropriate role models) will adversely influence the developing self-identity, resulting in unfavourable identity attributes (e.g. declining empathy). These may be adopted, via the hidden curriculum, from a poor understanding of role modelled behaviour in a challenging environment, or by mimicking "unprofessional" behaviours and attributes that are assumed to be favoured by the profession. 33

We therefore propose that there are important cognitive (intention, reflection) and affective (appreciation of other) elements to identity exploration in the workplace, and this is not simply a behavioural process. We are also cognisant of the differing understanding of the environment, either as something that is intimately connected to professional self-identity, or as presenting a persistent obstruction to it. On this basis, we have conceptualised identity formation as firstly requiring a self-environment connection to be formed, through environmental engagement. A failure of self to connect to the environment (because identity is formed out of context, or only based on select elements of the environment that align with the naïve self) results in an inability to learn from the environment, an identity that is uninformed by the workplace and an individual for whom environmental complexity obstructs the demonstration of desired behaviours. It is not possible for such an individual to negotiate their self-values into the professional identity, as it is demonstrated through their workplace behaviours. In a context-informed identity, the environment becomes part of the self-identity conceptualisation. Individuals with this self-environment identity construct can more easily negotiate their sense of identity into the work environment, and demonstrate behaviours that are aligned with self-values. Self-environment-behaviour connections are therefore achieved. Individuals are not consumed by the environment, and maintain a sense of self, such that dissonant actions and alternate opinions can be understood.

3. The time-dependence of professional identity formation: Nystrom's model and Perry's framework

The process of environmental engagement and informing identity will take time and represent a developmental process. It does not necessarily follow a smooth path: Erikson's

identity "crises" describe the sense of turmoil experienced as a previous identity is abandoned in the search for a more mature one (most notably in the transition from adolescence to an adult identity). ³⁴ Veterinary students who engage with identity formation in the workplace may experience this sense of "identity crisis" as they encounter challenges to their pre-conceived views of the veterinary identity, struggle to rationalise the complexity of alternate identity priorities, or observe that their preferred identity is not apparent in this context. The experiences of medical students demonstrate how they can become troubled when their priorities for being a "good doctor" are obscured in their role models by wider contextual challenges. ³⁵ Identity development in the workplace therefore requires support and guidance for students as they engage in this process. We will now use Perry's framework of intellectual maturity and Nystrom's model of professional identity formation to demonstrate how identity development requires a progressive increase in the complexity of a student's learning approach. This highlights the time-dependence of an appropriate identity model.

Identity-environment engagement requires a recognition of the complexity of the professional identity. A level of intellectual maturity is needed to appreciate that professional identity is multiple and not singular, varies according to an individual's priorities, is challenged by context, and may externally adapt according to stakeholder needs. Perry's framework²⁶ highlights that this appreciation of multiplicity and context-variation of knowledge is achieved only at a developed stage of intellectual maturity. Students are described as instead entering their college education with a more dualistic way of thinking: concepts are represented by single correct answers, with alternatives being incorrect. Kegan's conception of identity development, described by Cruess et al, 2 is built on this framework, and at college entry, students are understood to view identity as a singular concept, in which their own priorities are assumed to be universally represented in others. As students mature through their college education, Perry describes a progression, firstly to appreciating multiple perspectives, from which individuals can eventually define their own, context-dependent solutions (a "relativistic" understanding of knowledge). In terms of identity, this incorporates a recognition of the validity of alternate sets of priorities within the profession, and that context may influence the expression of these priorities and values with an individual professional. Perry's model emphasises the developmental nature of this maturity, and that it is unrealistic to expect complex and relativistic thinking at college-entry; identity development will therefore be gradual, and fostered over the course of the students' university experiences. The recognition of complexity in professional identity requires an appreciation of complexity in the clinic environment: if the clinic is understood by simple "gold standard" vs "inferior" sets of clinical actions, that are independent of

context, then it is unlikely the student will grasp the importance of complexity in their professional identity.

367368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

377

378379

380

381

382

383

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

391

366

Nystrom's model provides an additional lens for viewing the way novice professionals develop their engagement with their environment. 36 For the development of a professional identity, Nystrom starts with an immature identity, formed through the simple act of "fitting in": modelling one's behaviours on those of one's peers. In this naive stage, identity can be understood as representing a behaviourist approach to learning: the individual mirrors their actions on those of their social group. There is no sense of self, and therefore no appreciation of a connection (or disconnect) between self and behaviours, or a sense of self compared to others in the environment. With appropriate reflection on the activities observed in the workplace and on the individual's own actions, Nystrom describes the achievement of an "integrated" identity: one in which the individual can understand their own and others' actions in the context of their own values.³⁶ Identity understanding therefore becomes more cognitive and analytical, as reflection on the workplace enables the individual to develop an understanding of self-priorities. From this point, they need to determine how to negotiate the integration of these into different contexts: different workplace environments, as well as out-of-work spaces. Reflection and analysis of peers and role models in the workplace, their actions and their professional priorities, helps support the developing professional in determining how to negotiate their entry, and exteriorise their own sense of self in their behaviours. The peer group can be enabling to this process, as the shared experience of environmental complexity can lead to social construction of a collaboratively formed identity. For the individual novice professional, this socially-constructed understanding also comes from interactions with clients and the wider professional team, particularly through the construction of ways to interact with other. The resulting socially constructed identity facilitates the successful negotiation of entry to the new community, while retaining important self-beliefs, a concept important to Wenger's negotiated entry to a community of practice.²³

392393

394

395

396

397398

399

Both Perry and Nystrom expose intermediate positions of vulnerability. Perry describes a transition through multiplicity: as dualistic thinking is abandoned, individuals accept the existence of a range of views. All are of equal value, and therefore the individual struggles to make a decision. As they progress further they embrace relativism, when they recognise and commit to context-dependent solutions from the diversity of possible options. For Nystrom, immersion in the workplace is initially associated with compartmentalisation, where professional life is emphasised at the expense of self, and personal life becomes squeezed. Losing touch with the home and university social

environments may lead to a lack of social support for the individual's preferred sense of identity, they struggle to demonstrate their own values in their actions and behaviours, and constantly experience a need to act in a way that conflicts with their goals.³⁶

Our model: a time and context model of developing professional identity.

Our model of identity development, from entry into veterinary education to the early career, is shown in Figure 1. There are three stages depicted. First is a stage of "naïve self", which is prior to any engagement with the profession, and represents students entering their education. Any relevant prior experience would be inadequate to fully explore professional identity, as it would be from the stance of one outside the profession. Both Marcia's "foreclosed" and "diffused" identity statuses have been described as naïve identity constructs, due to the lack of exploration that has occurred in their development. Students may therefore have some idea of the type of veterinarian they wish to become, however the lack of prior full engagement with the profession means this cannot be constructed on the basis of identity exploration and understanding of alternatives. Alternatively, they may have little understanding of the importance of priorities and values to the veterinary professional.

The next stage represents exposure to the work environment, during student workplace learning and early career exposure. For some students this will be complete at the end of their formal education, and identity will remain unchanged as they enter the profession. For others this stage will extend into the early career, as graduates make use of early career experiences to continue to inform their identity development. It is at this stage that the pathways of identity development diverge, and the direction taken depends on the individual's engagement with their environment. The final stage, representing veterinary work, depicts how behaviours are aligned with self-identity values. It is at this stage that the individual gains full responsibility for their actions and behaviours, as they can now implement their clinical and professional decisions. It is most clear to the new professionals at this stage whether they are able to demonstrate the professional behaviours that are important to them. This stage will therefore have important implications for wellbeing, based on the individual's understanding of the connection between their self-identity and their actions.

In the model, the "negotiated" identity relies on the formation of self-environment connections during the stage of early workplace exposure. As the naïve individual enters the workplace, their engagement is as conceived by Billett, ³⁰ Bourdieu, ³² Nystrom ³⁶ and Wenger. ²³ Connection to the

environment (represented by overlapping shapes in the model) occurs through internal cognitive processes and affective factors, and external behavioural patterns. These include reflective analysis of the implications of identity differences, the appreciation of diverse work environments, multiple perspectives and different behaviours, and social collaboration to assist and validate the construction of a newly- adapted identity conceptualisation. This has many parallels with Bandura's agentic perspective on socio-cognitive development, which explains development in terms of "triadic reciprocal causation," with self, behaviour and environment all operating as "interacting determinants that influence one another bidirectionally" (p 14-15).³⁷ It also overcomes the limitations of the behaviourist emphasis of Korthagen's onion model. The formation of a connection between the self (what is valued) and the environment (what is valued in the environment) helps the novice professional to develop their self-awareness and self-understanding, as represented by Marcia's achieved identity status.²⁴ They are not completely absorbed by the norms and values of the profession, and the retention of an understanding of self that is distinct from the environment (the non-overlap between self and workplace) provides the individual with a reference point to their individual personal and professional values. It is this understanding of self as distinct from context that helps them understand differences between self and other, and also to negotiate entry to a variety of different workplace cultures.

This process of early environmental engagement contrasts with the pathway that leads to a fixed identity. On entering the work environment, there is an absence of cognitive, affective and behavioural engagement. The individual sees value only in those elements of the environment that reflect their own identity ideals; in all other aspects the failure to value and empathise with alternate perspectives prevents the formation of a self-environment connection. The self and environment therefore are depicted as largely non-overlapping. Engagement will only occur with the "perceived" environment: those aspects that fit with the individual's identity ideals. The identity therefore remains uninformed by environmental complexity, and similarly to Marcia's foreclosed identity status, is not a product of identity exploration. The students described by Matthew et al, 29 who selectively focus on practical skills and the "right" way to treat each disease, may represent these individuals, who become blinkered and selective in their workplace learning, and choose only to inform themselves of the values and actions that conform with their identity priorities.

For those who develop a behaviourist identity, entry to the work environment resembles Tajfel's "group identity" model. There is a lack of understanding of the concept of the self (similarly to Marcia's diffused identity status), and the individual is absorbed by the norms and actions of the

group. They transfer from a naïve self, with no understanding of their own values, to a behaviourist self: there is still no understanding of values, and they merely mimic the behaviours of their peers, demonstrating opinions and behaviours that meet with rewards (clients' gratitude, assessors' high marks, encouragement from employers). Their identity is based on behaviourist learning, and there is minimal analysis of the underlying reasons for the behaviours shown and actions taken.

In the final stage (early career), we see the consequences of earlier environmental connection for identity-behaviour alignment. For the "negotiated" identity, the process of engaging with the environment has imparted the characteristics of the achieved identity status: the ability to encounter conflicting views reflectively and non-defensively.²⁴ Their identity values are constructed on the basis of understanding the challenges of context and, as described by Ryan and Deci, ¹⁶ their wellbeing and sense of achievement come from overcoming contextual challenges in order to be able to act in accordance with their own values. Because of their broader notion of identity, which incorporates the challenges of the veterinary environment and working alongside other, behaviours tend to reflect these identity goals. They have therefore successfully negotiated a context-informed, adapted sense of their own identity into the work environment. As shown in the model, behaviours mostly overlap with self. However it is a feature of veterinary practice that, on occasion, the veterinarian must act in a way that is discordant with self-priorities, such as to empathise with other and provide support in an action that conflicts with self-beliefs. This is depicted in the model as behaviours that do not overlap with the self. Because this individual has a high level of selfawareness and understanding, an appreciation of other, and can value (if not internalise) the needs of other stakeholders, they understand that such actions do not reflect their own motivations and values. They therefore can be rationalised, and far from leading to the individual judging themselves poorly, are seen as successful in relation to contextual needs.

This contrasts with the pathway to the fixed identity. The lack of engagement with alternative perspectives within the work environment leads to strong boundaries between the sense of self, and the values and behaviours demonstrated by others in the workplace. Because of the lack of connection between self and environment, the individual struggles to negotiate the entry of their own values into the workplace, and, with the exception of rare situations in which context is aligned with self-values, they are unable to demonstrate behaviours that are aligned with self. The needs of others in the environment (clients, the resources available in the practice, practice norms) perpetually obstruct the connection between self-goals and aligned identity behaviours. Context therefore dictates the individual's actions (behaviours overlap with environment), but these are in

complete dissonance with self, meaning that the individual has no pride in their actions, and they impart no sense of achievement. To feel successful, the individual will need to do as described by Swann and Read¹⁵ and identify an environment that better fits their identity priorities. In such an environment, their identity depiction will look more like that of the "negotiated" identity, as behaviours will overlap with self. They will continue to struggle if contextual challenges threaten their actions, but they will have the support of like-minded peers.

For the behaviourist identity pathway, the individual has no trouble mimicking the behaviours of the group. They lack self-awareness, but model their conceptualisation of a good veterinarian on the values and behaviours modelled by their peers. As with Marcia's diffused identity status, they can thrive in a group setting, as they tend to be popular and fit in well. Without self-understanding and individual agency they have no reason to behave in a way that invites conflict. In an environment that does not invite challenge (for example one in which policy-led medicine is strong, and there is little professional autonomy) they may thrive and be rewarded for their work. However, they will struggle when faced with a complex decision, and will have limited ability to reflect on their own learning and development.

The time element of our model arises from the period of development needed for students and novice professionals to engage in complexity, develop powers of analysis, and be able to construct complex thinking by interacting with peers and with *other*. Perry noted that this stage of intellectual development is not necessarily reached by the end of college education, and therefore veterinary graduates may take variable periods of time to be able to engage in their work environments to inform their identity. ²⁶ Our model suggests that arrested development (persistence of a fixed or behaviourist identity) occurs without meaningful and agentic environmental engagement. However it is possible that for affected individuals, they will form self-environment connections at a later career stage, perhaps reflecting a more delayed development to relativistic thinking. Their development of an informed identity, their appreciation of complexity and valuing their autonomy (providing different solutions in different contexts), may all develop later. It may need later-career scaffolding in terms of mentoring or continuing professional development that encourages reflection on self.

Conclusions and future needs

There is always a danger of using a linear, discrete model to describe something as complex and messy as identity formation. In reality, the "fixed," "behavioural" and "negotiated" notions of professional identity may represent extremes, with students and graduates experiencing some situations in which aspects of their identity are well-defined, while in different situations they rely more on mimicking others. Although we have focused on the transition from student to novice professional as the most rapid period of identity change, the ongoing development of the negotiated professional identity, and the reshaping of self as the individual enters different environments, will likely continue throughout the veterinary career. It is perhaps the ability to continue to self-adapt, and experience the troubling re-thinking of self that best characterises the lifelong professional learner.

Our model is constructed principally on the recognition of key elements for the developing veterinarian that exist within empirical identity models. Our early research has informed the model construction, particularly emphasising the need to incorporate complex decision-making¹⁹ and the potential obstructive influence of the environment.¹⁰ However further identity research, across different stages of a veterinarian's career, is needed to validate the model and inform its ongoing development. This model of professional identity has contributed to curriculum design in our institution.³ Other authors have highlighted the lack of clear evidence supporting the benefits of veterinary professionalism teaching.³⁸ It will be interesting to evaluate whether a curriculum model that is focused on identity formation through individual agency, environmental engagement and reflection better supports student development, increases competence at engaging with complexity and improves resilience to discordant behaviours. May and Kinnison¹⁸ have previously identified that encouraging veterinarians to think differently about their professional role supports an improvement in career stress. The potential for a positive impact of this model on veterinary mental health is therefore an important issue to explore.

What purposes does our model serve? In constructing the elements of the competent, confident and resilient veterinarian, this has highlighted the importance of scaffolding to encourage engagement with the professional environment, and support for periods of possible identity "crisis". Key components of veterinary curricula will include provision of exposure to multiple professional identities, and strategies to encourage students to engage in these in the professional workplace. Particularly important will be efforts to facilitate students' recognition of broader notions of identity and career success, and reflect on how these compare to their own self-identity conceptions for

their future professional selves. It is vital to emphasise an identity which moves beyond patient healing, to a more holistic identity defined by managing environmental challenges, and integrating the patient, client, family, business, colleagues and hospital in decision frameworks. We have previously recognised that well-meaning workplace teaching strategies, aimed at optimising the students' experiences with complete clinical case material, absence of client complexity and a definitive diagnosis, may inadvertently narrow professional identity conceptions into a model of diagnosis and treatment. ³⁹ Role modelling the complexity of the clinician identity, discussing fallibility, and demonstrating wider notions of success, will all be valuable in validating the students' newly formed professional identities. This will give them the courage to identify with new identity ideals and allow them to graduate from clinical programmes with the tools to develop with the evolution of their individual career trajectories.

Acknowledgments:

We would like the thank Dr Kelly Coate and Mrs Sharon Markless, King's College London, for their mentoring, supervision, support and intellectual input during Mrs Armitage-Chan's PhD.

586 References

- Mossop, E. (2012). Is it time to define veterinary professionalism? *Journal of Veterinary Medical Education*, 39(1), 93-100.
- Cruess, R., Cruess, S., Boudreau, J., Snell, L. and Steinert, Y. (2014). Reframing Medical
 Education to Support Professional Identity Formation. *Academic Medicine*, 89(11), pp.1446 1451.
- 3. Armitage-Chan, E and May, SA. Developing a professional studies curriculum to support
 veterinary professional identity formation. *In press*, Journal of Veterinary Medical Education.
- Castellani, B., & Hafferty, F. W. (2006). The complexities of medical professionalism.
 In *Professionalism in Medicine* (pp. 3-23). Springer US.
- 5. Erikson, E. H. (1959). Identity and the life cycle: Selected papers. *Psychological issues*.
- 597 6. Tajfel, H. (1982). Social identity and intergroup relations. Cambridge University Press.
- 598
 Stryker, S., & Burke, P. J. (2000). The past, present, and future of an identity theory. *Social psychology quarterly*, 284-297.
- 8. RCVS Survey of Recent Graduates, 2013. Available at:
 http://www.rcvs.org.uk/publications/rcvs-survey-of-recent-graduates-ies-2013, accessed
 13/5/17.
- 9. May, SA. (2015). Towards a scholarship of primary health care. *Veterinary Record*, *176*(26),677-681.
- 605 *10.* Armitage-Chan, E., & May, S. A. Identity, environment and mental wellbeing. *Submitted to Veterinary Record*
- 11. Thoits, P. (2012). Self, Identity, Stress, and Mental Health. *Handbooks of Sociology and Social Research*, pp.357-377.
- Wald, H., Anthony, D., Hutchinson, T., Liben, S., Smilovitch, M. and Donato, A. (2015).
 Professional Identity Formation in Medical Education for Humanistic, Resilient Physicians.
 Academic Medicine, 90(6), pp.753-760.
- 612 13. Taylor, C. (1989). *Sources of the self*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- 513 14. Suh, E. M. (2002). Culture, identity consistency, and subjective well-being. *Journal of personality and social psychology*, 83(6), 1378.
- Swann, W. B., & Read, S. J. (1981). Self-verification processes: How we sustain our self conceptions. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, *17*(4), 351-372.
- 617 16. Ryan, R. and Deci, E. (2000). Self-determination theory and the facilitation of intrinsic motivation, social development, and well-being. *American Psychologist*, 55(1), pp.68-78.

- 17. Pratt, M., Rockmann, K. and Kaufmann, J. (2006). Constructing professional identity: The role
 of work and identity learning cycles in the customization of identity among medical
 residents. Academy of Management Journal, 49(2), pp.235-262.
- 18. May, S. A., & Kinnison, T. (2015). Continuing professional development: learning that leads to change in individual and collective clinical practice. *Veterinary Record*, *177*(1), 13-13.
- 19. Armitage-Chan, E., Maddison, J. and May, S. (2016). What is the veterinary professional identity? Preliminary findings from web-based continuing professional development in veterinary professionalism. *Veterinary Record*, 178(13), pp.318-318.
- 20. Beijaard, D., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering research on teachers'
 professional identity. *Teaching and teacher education*, 20(2), 107-128.
- Ajzen, I. and Fishbein, M. (2005). The influence of attitudes on behaviour. In: D. Albarracin,
 B. Johnson and M. Zanna, ed., *The handbook of attitudes*, 1st ed. New York: Psychology
 Press.
- 432 22. Hogg, M., Terry, D. and White, K. (1995). A Tale of Two Theories: A Critical Comparison of
 633 Identity Theory with Social Identity Theory. Social Psychology Quarterly, 58(4), p.255.
- 634 23. Wenger, E. (1998). Communities of practice: Learning as a social system. *Systems* thinker, 9(5), 2-3.
- 637 24. Kroger, J. and Marcia, J. (2011). The Identity Statuses: Origins, Meanings, and Interpretations. *Handbook of Identity Theory and Research*, pp.31-53.

- Cramer, P. (2017). Identity change between late adolescence and adulthood. *Personality and Individual Differences*, 104, 538-543.
- 26. Perry, W. (1968). Patterns of Development in Thought and Values of Students in a Liberal
 Arts College: A Validation of a Scheme. Final Report. [online] Available at:
 http://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED024315 [Accessed 8 Sep. 2016].
- Billett, S. and Somerville, M. (2004). Transformations at work: identity and learning. *Studies in Continuing Education*, 26(2), pp.309-326.
- 646 28. Korthagen, F. (2004). In search of the essence of a good teacher: towards a more holistic approach in teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 20(1), pp.77-97.
- 648 29. Matthew, S., Taylor, R. and Ellis, R. (2012). Relationships between students' experiences of 649 learning in an undergraduate internship programme and new graduates' experiences of 650 professional practice. *High Educ*, 64(4), pp.529-542.
- 30. Billett, S (2007) Exercising self through working life: Learning, work and identity. In: A
 Brown, S Kirpal & F. Raumer (Eds) Identities at work. Springer, Dordecht, The Netherlands. P
 184.

654	31.	Gecas, V. (1985). Self-concept. In: A. Kuper and J. Kuper, ed., The Social Science
655		Encylopaedia, 1st ed. London: Routledge, pp.739.
656	32.	Lizardo, O. (2004). The cognitive origins of Bourdieu's habitus. Journal for the Theory of
657		Social Behaviour, 34(4), 375-401.
658	33.	Leo, T. and Eagen, K. (2008). Professionalism Education: The Medical Student
659		Response. Perspectives in Biology and Medicine, 51(4), pp.508-516.
660	34.	Côté, J. and Levine, C. (1987). A formulation of Erikson's theory of ego identity formation.
661		Developmental Review, 7(4), pp.273-325.
662	35.	Martimianakis, M., Maniate, J. and Hodges, B. (2009). Sociological interpretations of
663		professionalism. <i>Medical Education</i> , 43(9), pp.829-837.Nyström, S. (2008). The Dynamics of
664		Professional Identity Formation: Graduates' Transitions from Higher Education to Working
665		Life. Vocations and Learning, 2(1), pp.1-18.
666	36.	Nyström, S. (2008). The Dynamics of Professional Identity Formation: Graduates' Transitions
667		from Higher Education to Working Life. Vocations and Learning, 2(1), pp.1-18.
668	37.	Bandura, A. (2001). Social cognitive theory: An agentic perspective. Annual review of
669		psychology, 52(1), pp 1-26.
670	38.	Cake, M. A., Bell, M. A., Williams, J. C., Brown, F. J., Dozier, M., Rhind, S. M., & Baillie, S.
671		(2016). Which professional (non-technical) competencies are most important to the success
672		of graduate veterinarians? A Best Evidence Medical Education (BEME) systematic review:
673		BEME Guide No. 38. Medical teacher, 38(6), 550-563.
674	39.	Armitage-Chan, E. (2016). Assessing Professionalism: A Theoretical Framework for Defining
675		Clinical Rotation Assessment Criteria. Journal of Veterinary Medical Education, pp.1-8.
676		
677		
678		
679 680		
681		
682		
JUL		
683		

Figure 1: Time and Context Model of Professional Identity formation

Legend: This model depicts three key stages in the novice professional's identity formation. During Stage 1, the "naïve self" represents the student at the start of their veterinary education, with no prior meaningful engagement in the professional environment, and no concept of their professional identity goals. In Stage 2, the student enters the workplace, initially through curriculum opportunities (clinical rotations, external placements) and later as they continue to learn and inform their identity during graduate life. At this stage, identity formation is dependent on how the individual engages with workplace learning opportunities, and whether they use these to inform their developing identity and develop self-environment connections. Self-environment connection is depicted by overlapping shapes. The final stage represents the actions and behaviours of veterinary work, when it becomes apparent whether self-identity is successfully negotiated into professional identity. Successful negotiation enables self-environment-behaviour connections (shown as overlapping shapes): the extent of overlap depicts the extent to which behaviours can be aligned with self-values within the work environment.

A Time and Context Model of Developing Professional Identity

